

LETTERE AL DIRETTORE — *LETTERS TO THE EDITOR*
LETTRES AU DIRECTEUR - *CARTAS AL DIRECTOR*

ON THE ROCK ART IN TANZANIA

Your report on the Rock Art of Tanzania (BCSP 23, pp. 15-68) should awaken further international interest for a cultural heritage which will soon be lost for ever. My book 'Africa's Vanishing Art' (Doubleday, New York, 1983) includes all the worth-while reproductions that were made by us in Tanzania. During our work on the paintings in 1951, we had no adequate camera nor colour film and we relied on tracing and copying the paintings by hand. We paid great attention to sorting out the sequence of styles and the superpositions. The illustrations provide a faithful record of the *status-quo* in 1951. Thirty years later the state of preservation is very different, not from weathering, drip or any natural causes but from deliberate human vandalism. A particularly glaring example is the rock shelter of Kisesse 1. This was one of the finest sites in the whole region with paintings of exceptional artistic merit. I saw it first in 1935; by 1951, some damage had been done by chipping away the red colour but by 1982 it was virtually impossible to decipher the paintings and all the beautiful line drawings had disappeared. Not only had the paint been chipped off deliberately but herd boys had scrawled over the paintings with knives or sharp rocks and drawn grotesque human faces by the same method. The site is virtually destroyed. Many other sites show evidence of such deliberate vandalism. Since the region is now much more thickly populated as with herds grazing on the rocky slopes, it is to be expected that vandalism will become even more widespread.

The main problems are the number of sites, lack of transport for the guards and inability of the Antiquities Department to supervise the maintenance and protection of the sites. Their budget is wholly inadequate. According to the Director of Antiquity, education of the local people is the only hope of protecting the sites from further destruction. This is an admirable aim but I do not see that it will become effective for many years and by

that time it is unlikely that many paintings will have survived.

In my view it is of the utmost urgency for the existing paintings to be recorded. In view of their importance I believe that funds could be raised, possibly through UNESCO, for a survey team to make a comprehensive study of the Kondoa paintings, mainly a photographic record, but also detailed notes on sequence of styles, analysis of the pigments used etc. Infrared photography would almost certainly reveal more of the faded, obscure paintings than can be seen by the naked eye. Unfortunately no substantial aid can be expected from the Government other than goodwill and cooperation. Funds for a survey would have to be raised elsewhere. Indeed it is my hope that this note might further contribute to arise public opinion.

Mary Leakey
Nairobi, Kenya

L'ART RUPESTRE DE TANZANIE

Votre présentation de l'art rupestre de Tanzanie et de sa fabuleuse séquence chronologique m'ont beaucoup intéressé. (BCSP 23) Permettez-moi de vous faire part de mon admiration pour le travail de terrain et d'élaboration postérieure que cela représente.

Ce qui m'a paru être des encroûtements de calcite consécutifs à des écoulements en nappe ou à des ruissellements localisés, anciens, sub-actuels ou actuels, devrait être datable par des méthodes géomicrobiologiques. Le fait que certaines peintures soient fortement oblitérées par ces calcins m'implique pas nécessairement une très longue période dans leur développement. Avez-vous fait procédé à quelques prélèvements pour analyses chimiques et autres?

En ce qui concerne les supports, quelles sont les natures pétrographiques dominantes de votre secteur?

Enfin, en regardant vos belles photos, j'ai l'impression qu'une assez forte proportion d'œuvres rupestres est dans un état d'altération assez avancée. Une protection de cet art rupestre, même élémentaire, existe-t-elle en Tanzanie?

François Soleilhavoup
Département de
Géographie Physique
Univ. P. et M. CURIE,
Paris, France

Les analyses chimiques seront réalisées prochainement. La roche dominante est de caractère granitique. En ce qui concerne la protection, la création de parcs et l'engagement de gardiens sont envisagés par le Département des Antiquités.

ROCK ART INVENTORY IN ZAMBIA

Zambia has a rich rock art heritage and it needs international support to record and protect it adequately. We have recorded over a hundred rock art sites, ranging in age from 18,000 years ago to the 18th century A.D. Unfortunately, these sites are not adequately inventoried and conserved because, to date, Zambia does not have anyone specialized in rock art preservation. This year however, a chemist employed by the National Monuments Commission is to be trained as a conservator. Since rock art seems to be the most threatened among Zambia's relics, we hope the international community will help us in training this man. We think the field course your Centre organises every year will be adequate to give him the necessary knowledge and techniques to inventory Zambia's rock art. Thereafter, we wish to request that you second an expert to work with our man on rock art documentation.

N.M. Katanekwa
Director
National Monuments Commission
Livingstone, Zambia

Applications for the Summer School in Rock Art Studies should be addressed to Centro Camuno di Studi Preistorici. Requests for consultants, the Cultural Heritage Division, UNESCO, Paris. Applications for scholarships may be addressed to both.

ROCK ART SALVAGE IN GRENADA

New petroglyphs have recently been discovered in Grenada. No doubt many more could be found if a survey was carried out. Several known sites are increasingly being damaged by visitors and at least one important locality is being destroyed by the construction of a road.

Unfortunately, we have no laws pertaining to the preservation of historical monuments and sites. We are in urgent need of help in recording rock art sites so that some documentation of them will remain.

Michael J.J. Jessamy
Grenada National Museum
West Indies

It is becoming ever more urgent to train rock art specialists. For this purpose, a few scholarships are available, for which potential candidates may submit applications. Under programs of international and regional cooperation, support for well conceived projects may be considered.

NO ROCK ART IN GHANA?

Rock art is one of humankind's earliest endeavours at communication, and forms a priceless evidence of World Cultural Heritage.

It is regretted that as of now, Ghana has no record of rock art, however, we wish to initiate cooperation to search for rock art in our country.

Dr. I.N. Dabrah
Ghana Museum & Monuments
Accra

Ghana is one of the few countries in the world where rock art has not yet been reported. But this does not mean that no rock art exists there. Once the first site is discovered, others will follow.

"SACRED" AND "SECULAR" IN AUSTRALIAN ROCK ART

Recently I have been questioned by several scholars about the terms "sacred" and "secular" in my research on Aboriginal rock art in Australia. It seems clear that many people are uncomfortable with distinguishing between sacred and secular within a tribal context. I would like to

express my viewpoint briefly, and hopefully to clear up some of the misconceptions that are held about Aboriginal concepts of spirituality.

When I was conducting fieldwork concerning the nature and function of sacred places in Aboriginal culture, I came to conclude that the Aborigines do distinguish between the two very important and real realms of sacred and secular. The distinction is subtle, and the philosophy is complex. However, the understanding of these concepts will add depth to our appreciation of Aboriginal art and culture.

Anthropologists who have worked among the Aborigines have long noted the chain which links the realms of sacred and temporal. In some of the more insightful works, these realms are shown to be in an integrated harmony, rather than in conflict. Together they make up a single rainbow of blending colors. These colors are interconnected, yet they are individual elements with distinguishable characteristics of their own. As A.P. Elkin has noted, Aboriginal art consists of various elements which may be distinguished, but which are so fluidly integrated that they cannot be separated. Robert Berndt has written of what he calls the "mundane-sacred continuum". The point is that the two realms do exist in Aboriginal cosmology, although perhaps not independently.

For the purposes of examining relationships in rock art, it is essential to categorize the design elements. Through fieldwork among various tribal groups in Australia, I have come to realize that in Aboriginal art there are degrees of sacredness. If we approach our research cautiously and with an open mind, we might find that this distinction provides an important and culturally recognized category through we can further our understanding of the role of rock art in Aboriginal culture.

In Aboriginal Australia, spirituality does enter into most all aspects of daily living. This is not to say, however, that the Aborigines are incapable of taking their philosophy one more step and incorporating secular concepts into their very rich metaphysics. Meanwhile, our own quest for truth continues. In this search we must learn to be inquisitive, open-minded and willing to abandon. In these and other ways, the Aborigines have succeeded.

Paul Faulstich
Alhambra, California

NEW ROCK ENGRAVINGS AT JUMILLA, (MURCIA), SPAIN

I wish to communicate the recent discovery of new schematic engravings, including cup and ring marks, cup marks, footprints, and 340 meter so-called 'topographical patterns' over of rock surface in the vicinity of Jumilla (Murcia).

J. Molina
Museo Municipal
Jumilla, Spain

Fig. 1



Fig. 2



Figs. 1-2
Recently discovered engravings from Jumilla, Spain.

TROIS PROBLEMES POSES PAR HAR KARKOM

1. Datation de l'Exode:

Il ne faudrait pas exclure qu'il y ait eu contact entre les dernières populations séjournant au pied de Har Karkom et de nouveaux arrivants, sémites nomadisant dans le Néguev au XIXe siècle av. J.-C. Il est possible que ces lieux de culte, les croyances qui y sont connexes et, sans doute, certains des rites premiers aient été transmis par les peuples qui s'y sont succédés. Peut-on envisager que Har Karkom soit devenu un lieu de pèlerinage sans population sédentaire (donc ne laissant pas de vestiges), dont le caractère sacré se serait transmis pendant des générations? Dans ce cas, il n'y aurait plus de problème chronologique.

2. Har Karkom est-il le Mont Sinaï?

Les analyses de certains exégètes localisent une montagne sainte, sous diverses appellations selon les traditions, au sud du Seïr et au nord de Madian, entre la Araba et le plateau de Tien, sans pouvoir en préciser la position géographique. Dans cette zone, précisément en son centre, Har Karkom est la seule montagne correspondant à la description traditionnelle. Pour ce qui est de la description des itinéraires menant au Mont Sinaï, nous pouvons considérer que les indications du nombre de jours nécessaires à la route correspondent à des chiffres liturgiques, sans valeur topographique. Par contre, Dt. 1,2 mentionne '11 jours de marche entre l'Horeb et Cadès-Barneá par la montagne de Seïr'. Or, il existe en effet un chemin très ancien d'Ain el Qudeirat (Cadès-Barneá) vers le sud et le puits de Beer Karkom.

3. Coïncidence des descriptions des lieux entre rédactions Jahaviste et Elohistes et le site de Har Karkom lui-même.

Il y a deux explications possibles:

-Les groupes israélites ayant vécu les événements auraient pu transmettre à leurs descendants une description précise de ce site important. Il est possible aussi que certains y soient retournés avant ou pendant les rédactions Jahaviste ou Elohistes. Le pèlerinage d'Elie à l'Horeb, par exemple, montre que la localisation en était connue.

-Pendant la rédaction Jahaviste puis Elohistes, le roi Salomon, voulant affirmer sa souveraineté sur les tribus aux tendan-

ces autonomistes, avait intérêt à concentrer l'attention sur Jérusalem, capitale du royaume. La démarche du rédacteur aurait donc été de rapporter exactement la description des lieux, comme elle était connue dans la tradition des tribus du nord et du sud, tout en laissant intentionnellement un certain flou sur la localisation exacte et les itinéraires d'accès. Ceci afin que les tribus autonomistes oublient peu à peu l'emplacement du Mont Sinaï et ne soient pas tentées d'y instaurer un lieu de culte ou de pèlerinage pouvant rivaliser avec Jérusalem.

André Lassale
Neuilly sur Seine, France

HAR KARKOM AND KADESH BARNEA

You made a very good case for Har Karkom being the real Mount Sinai. It certainly seems as though 'the Mountain of God', to which both Moses and Elijah made pilgrimages, would have been a place of pilgrimage for other people as well. However, Deuteronomy 1:2 says 'It is eleven days' journey from Horeb unto Kadesh-barnea by the way of Mount Seir'. Would it have taken eleven day to go that short a distance?

Paul Alciere
Hingham, MA, USA

This passage is discussed in full in The Mountain of God, New York (Rizzoli) 1986. In synthesis from various biblical passages it appears that there are several ways to go from Horeb to Kadesh Barnea. According to Deut. 1:2, this one, via Mount Seir, requires eleven days, meaning that there are ten stations on the way, or ten wells where one can get water.

Before the domestication of the camel, a human group in the desert could hardly have covered more than an average of 15 km daily. And they would have needed water every day.

Topographical and other elements allowed as to propose the identification of Mount Seir with Jebel Arif en-Nake. From Har Karkom to Ein Kudeirat (Kadesh Barnea) by the way of Jebel Arif en-Nake, there is only one way offering water sources at intervals of no more than 15 km from each other.

From Har Karkom to Ein Kudeirat the distances are:

1. Har Karkom - Beer Karkom	7 km
2. Beer Karkom - Thamilat Bereká	15 km
3. Bereká - Ein Mugbara	13 km
4. Ein Mugbara - Bir Main	7 km
5. Bir Main - Bir el-Beida	9 km
6. Bir el-Beida - Riyash	14 km
7. Riyash - Thumilat el-Aguz	13 km
8. Thumilat el-Aguz - Tabghat ez-Zafra	15 km
9. Tabghat ez-Zafra - Bir es-Sáida	11 km
10. Bir es-Sáida - El-Kuseime	12 km
11. El-Kuseime - Ein Kudeirat	8 km
	<hr/>
TOTAL	124 km

It is a nice walk and the landscape is splendid! With camels it takes 4-5 days; with a jeep you can make it in one day. But for a walking team it takes eleven days to go 'from Har Karkom to Ein Kudeirat by the way of Jebel Arif en-Nake'.

HAR KARKOM AND THE DATE OF EXODUS

I attended your lecture at U.C.L.A. on Har Karkom. You have shown us intriguing parallels between the findings of this mountain and the Biblical descriptions of Mount Sinai. As I understand, one of the main stumbling blocks for this identification is the dating to the Early and the beginning of the Middle Bronze Age.

Our journal, *Catastrophism and Ancient History*, has for a long time been at variance with the overwhelming majority of archaeologists who put the Exodus and the Conquest in the Late Bronze Age. One of their main archaeological supports for this date comes from the excavations at Hazor. In his book *Hazor, A Rediscovery of a Great Citadel*, Dr. Y. Yadin relates that he found there a Late Bronze Age stratum destroyed by fire. This he claims was the work of Joshua and gives a date for the Exodus and Conquest in the Late Bronze Age (Yadin, *Hazor*, p. 145).

However, it is my belief that the big ash layer at the end of the Middle Bronze Age represents the time of Joshua (id., p.37). Other scholars who write for our journal believe that an Early Bronze Age destruction there represents Joshua.

Perhaps the best way to date Joshua is to look at the excavations at Jericho. Jericho more than any other city in the Holy Land

is identified with Joshua. If the majority of scholars are correct, there should be a Late Bronze Age city, and the city walls destroyed spectacularly. There are neither. Dr. Kathleen Kenyon, who excavated there, explain the problem of the missing Late Bronze Age city and walls by saying that they eroded away. In her book, *Archaeology in the Holy Land* (p. 198) Dr. Kenyon states that there is a gap in Jericho during a large part of the Late Bronze Age was eroded away leaving only a few scattered remains.

Dr. Kenyon does describe a Middle Bronze Age destruction relating that walls were greatly disturbed (id., p. 197). However, she further describes an Early Bronze Age disaster at Jericho.

Other colleagues have seized upon this Early Bronze Age destruction at Jericho, as Garstang had done earlier, as the time of Joshua. They go on to point out rightly that Ai, the next city after Jericho in the Book of Joshua, has no Middle Bronze Age or Late Bronze Age (*Biblical Archaeologist*, vol. 39, pp. 18-19).

One more interesting note: we have long believed that the Egyptian text, *Admonitions of Ipuwer*, can be compared to the story of the Ten Plagues. Both talk of the River turning to blood, days of darkness, and other similar disturbances. This hieroglyphic text is dated to either the First Intermediate Period (end of Early Bronze Age) of the Middle Bronze Age) of Egypt (John Van Seters, *The Hyksos.*, pp. 103-120).

If Har Karkom turned out to be the holy mountain referred to by the Bible as Sinai, is chronology would not fit my scheme, but would fit those who believe that the end of the Early Bronze Age and the beginning of the Middle Bronze Age was the time of the Exodus and the Conquest. A forthcoming article in our journal is in fact trying to establish this chronology.

Marvin Arnold Luckerman
Executive Editor,
*Catastrophism and
Ancient History*,
Los Angeles

HAR KARKOM AND CHURCH TRADITIONS

After the comments appeared in BCSP 23. I am sure that the letters will be flying fast and furious now, in view of your

published findings on Mt. Karkom. Strong opposition from various sides is to be expected, for church traditions always die hard, even in the face of established truth.

Personally, I have been much inspired in recent months in my studies on the route of the Israelites, especially in regard to the real Mt. Sinai that we now know to be Mt. Karkom in the Negev.

Rev. M.D. Linhart
Tucson, Arizona, USA

HAR KARKOM ET LE SINAI 'OFFICIEL'

Etant convaincu que E. Anati effectivement découvert le 'vrai' Mont Sinaï, je voudrais ajouter quelques arguments au débat sur Har Karkom.

Suivant un raisonnement logique, il *fallait* que la Montagne de Moïse ait un sommet d'accès aisé. Moïse n'aurait pas pu en faire l'ascension et la descente plusieurs fois si des qualités hors du commun étaient nécessaires. Il fallait aussi que le sommet présentât une surface suffisante pour accueillir une 'nuée-gloire'. Lorsqu'il pénétrait la nuée, Moïse devait avoir du sol ferme sous ses pieds. Tout sommet en

forme de pic, crête ou pain de sucre serait donc à exclure. De plus, le sommet avait été expressément défendu à plus de 70 hommes âgés (les 'anciens' de Ex. 24: 1,9) ainsi qu'aux hommes, femmes et enfants des 12 tribus. Un accès difficile ou un sommet exigu auraient rendu une telle interdiction inutile. Tout ceci nous aide à comprendre la conception de la topographie qui accompagne les descriptions bibliques.

Je ne crois pas que le mont Sinaï 'officiel' dans le sud de la Péninsule, réponde à ces conditions. Culminant à environ 2640 m. (moins l'altitude de la plaine environnante), son ascension ne semble pas aisée et demande quelques efforts. D'autre part, il ne me semble pas que le mont Sinaï 'officiel' ait à son sommet le vaste 'théâtre' requis pour les scènes décrites dans la Torah. Har Karkom, par contre, avec ses 847 m. (moins l'altitude du désert environnant), ses deux sentiers d'accès et son plateau de 4 x 2 km. convient idéalement.

Guy L.R. de Decker
Nyons, France

Fig. 3
Har Karkom viewed from one of the Bronze Age campsites at its foot.

